L1 Influence on Writing in L2 among UCSI Chinese Students: A Case Study

Dipolog-Ubanan, G. F.

English Language and Communication Department, Faculty of Social Sciences and Liberal Arts, UCSI University, No.1 Jalan Menara Gading, UCSI Heights, 56000 Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

ABSTRACT

Approximately one-third of the students of the English Language and Communication (ELC) Department at UCSI University come from mainland China. As English is the medium of instruction in almost all courses in the university, these students are exposed to various situations where the English language is used. They do not encounter major difficulties with the spoken language, but problems emerge when they write paragraphs, reports, or term papers. This study aims to investigate the common errors in the paragraphs written by ELC Chinese students and suggest ways to address this problem. Paragraphs written by the 30 Chinese students who registered between January and May semesters 2015 were analyzed and categorized into types of errors. Moreover, 10 students (from the May semester) were interviewed to solicit their ideas on what aspects of writing in English they found difficult, and how these problems could be solved. The results showed that the most common errors were on word choice and word form, spelling, tenses, use of articles and determiners, number, and agreement of subject and verb. The interview further revealed that students were aware of the interference of their first language (L1) on their writing in English, and of their tendency to translate from their L1 to English when writing in English.

Keywords: Writing errors, LI interference, mother tongue, L2, Chinese students

INTRODUCTION

Each year, students from various parts of China come to Malaysia to pursue their degrees from various tertiary institutions in the country. Many of them enroll in private higher education institutions like UCSI University. As English is the medium of instruction in almost all courses in the
university, these students are exposed to various situations where the English language is used. Class discussions, presentations, written and oral reports, assignments, and term/project papers, to mention a few, are all conducted in the English language. Generally, Chinese students handle fairly well the oral communication activities in English. However, problems emerge when they write in English. One of the common complaints among writing teachers is the number of errors students make when they write in English. Moreover, they tend to commit the same mistakes repeatedly. Very often they use the rules and structures of Mandarin Chinese or their dialect in their communication in English (Timina, 2013). This automatic transfer, due to ingrained linguistic habits, of the surface structure of the mother tongue onto the surface structure of the target language is defined by Dulay et al. (1982) as the mother tongue (L1) interference. This interference results in ungrammatical or broken English. The errors caused by the influence of the L1 are referred to as L1 interference or L1 transfer errors. The term L1 interference is not new in L2 acquisition; however, it is an important factor to be considered in English instruction, particularly in the case when the instructor’s knowledge of the students’ native language is limited or insufficient.

Although English language is a required foreign language in China, students rarely use it outside the classrooms. According to Ye (2013), Chinese traditional English teaching methods put emphasis primarily on grammar, vocabulary and reading skills. English writing is either ignored or given less emphasis. In language learning classrooms, most often the focus is on memorizing grammatical rules and vocabulary, translating texts from Chinese to English, and doing textbook exercises (Ye, 2013). The emphasis of the L2 activities is not on using the English language in communication but in mastering the English language forms and functions. Students lack the experience of using the English language in real life communication situations outside the classroom, where the memorized phrases and expressions may not be applicable at all.

Various studies on the writing of Chinese students have argued that there is an interference or transfer of their L1 to their writing in L2 and revealed that grammatical, lexical, syntactic and semantic errors appear in their writings in English (Wang & Wen, 2002; Liu, 2008; Wang, P., 2008; Darus & Ching, 2009; Darus & Subramaniam, 2009; Smerdov, 2011; Wang, H., 2011; Timina, 2013; Ye, 2013; Zou, 2013).

Making errors is inevitable in second language acquisition, and, according to Dulay et al. (1982), these errors are analyzable by comparing the language systems between L1 and L2. Corder (1983) defined language transfer as a term referring to speakers’ or writers’ application of knowledge from their L1 to the L2. Odlin (1989) explained that language transfer occurs due partly to the similarities and/or differences between the L2 and any L1 that the learner has previously acquired. He further stressed that language transfer impacts on the writing of L2 learners.
This small qualitative case study aims to (1) identify the common errors found in the paragraphs written by ELC Chinese students, (2) examine what aspects of the English language they find difficult, and (3) explore possible strategies to help students improve their writing.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Studies on the interference of the L1 on the L2 acquisition have pointed out that the more dissimilarities there are between the L1 and L2 structures the more learning difficulties would appear for the learner to handle (Timina, 2013). Hence, when the learner is in a quandary when writing in L2 s/he would resort to his/her L1 forms and structures for help. Dechert (1983, cited in Timina, 2013) states that the greater the structural differences between the L1 and L2, the greater the number of transfer errors made in L2 by the learner.

Liu (2008) reviewed the development of the use and effect of L1 in L2 writing from three areas: traditions of Chinese and English writing, language switch in the writing process and language transfer. Liu explained that in Chinese writing traditions, “rhetorical indirectness” is the “goal to maintain harmony and avoid impoliteness so that their L2 writing appears vague and indirect to create solidarity between the speaker and the hearer” (p, 50). According to Timina (2013), the traditional English writing structure is different from the Chinese writing style. In Chinese writing, the writer “leaves it to readers to interpret the content, understand the deeper meanings and appreciate the artistic beauty” of the composition (Timina, 2013, p.3). Moreover, the level of originality and creativity of many Chinese learners of English is minimal as they often borrow patterns from textbooks and express few opinions in the compositions (Smerdov, 2011). Chinese writers tend to use proverbs, maxims and fixed expressions in their writing while English writers tend to use their own words and ideas (Chen, 2006, cited in Timina, 2013).

It is needless to say that the Chinese students have already developed a systematic L1 knowledge before they begin to learn English, and that they most often use and apply their L1 knowledge (language rules, word forms, sentence structures and habits) in their writing. Wang and Wen’s (2002) study on the effects of L1 literacy capabilities on L2 writing ability of Chinese EFL learners revealed that Chinese writers are more likely to rely on their L1 when they are managing their writing processes.

L2 writers switch to L1 frequently in the process of writing, which is a fairly common strategy among L2 writers. Numerous studies of L2 other than English (Ecuadorian Spanish, Arabic, Thai, Tamil, Amharic) have revealed that L2 learners used their L1 and L2 for various purposes while composing in L2 (Bhela, 1999; Bennui, 2008; Hussein & Mohammad, 2011; Watcharapunyawong & Usaha, 2013; Yigzaw, 2013; Solano et. al, 2014).

In the same way, various studies showed that Chinese students utilize their L1 when they write in English (Wang & Wen, 2002;

Zhang (2003, cited in Ye, 2013) stated that linguistic errors in China’s college students’ L2 writing arise from the mother tongue interference, while Jiang (2001, cited in Ye, 2013) pointed out that the L1 negative transfer does not only occur in such aspects as grammar and vocabulary but also “in culture and thinking modes” (p, 36). These researchers investigated the specific types of mistakes in Chinese students’ English writing caused by the mother tongue culture. Ye (2013) who did a survey of 200 English compositions found that 73% of the mistakes in the students’ compositions are linked to the influence of their native culture. Ye divided the mistakes caused by the influence of the mother culture into four categories: poor diction; Chinese thinking patterns; mixture of sentence structures; incoherence in statements. Timina (2013), on the other hand, explored two aspects of the interference of Chinese language elements in students’ writing in English including the rhetorical patterns and grammatical and lexical usage.

When students whose L1 is Mandarin Chinese (or any of the Chinese dialects) write in English, a lot of their L1 characteristics are revealed due to direct translation from Chinese into English. The result is the so-called Chinglish, a mixture of Chinese and English, which is ungrammatical and unintelligible to foreign teachers (Timina, 2013).

**METHODOLOGY**

Questionnaire and interview were the methods employed to collect the data for this small qualitative case study. The questionnaire was used to collect socio-demographic information while the one-on-one interview was used to solicit the students’ thoughts on why they found writing in English difficult and how their writing teacher could help them improve their writing. The discussion was based on the analysis of the students written paragraphs and on their answers to the interview questions.

The 30 ELC students from mainland China who registered between January and May semesters 2015 were asked to complete the questionnaire which contained two parts: Part 1 asked personal information questions and Part 2 was the paragraph writing. In Part 2, they were asked to write a 150-word paragraph on the topic ‘My experiences while studying at UCSI University’. They were allowed to take the questionnaire home and to return it within a week. The paragraphs were analyzed for lexical, grammatical and syntactic errors.

Furthermore, 10 students from the May semester were interviewed to solicit their opinions on what aspects of writing in English they found difficult or challenging, and how they thought these problems could be solved. These 10 student-interviewees were conveniently selected from the 30 Chinese ELC students. Year 1 students were purposely not chosen because of their timidity and shyness in sharing their thoughts. The questions asked during the
interview were 1) Do you find writing in English easy or difficult, and why?, 2) Which aspects of the writing in English do you find easy or difficult, grammar, vocabulary, or mechanics, and why?, 3) How can the ELC writing teachers help you improve your writing in English?

Table 1
Interviewees’ Profile

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Below 25 years old</th>
<th>Above 25 years old</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital Status</td>
<td>Single</td>
<td>Married</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year Level</td>
<td>2nd Year</td>
<td>3rd Year</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 shows the profile of the 10 interviewees selected from the 30 Chinese ELC students from mainland China. Year 1 Chinese students were purposely not selected as they were still adjusting to their university life and being asked to be interviewed would be an additional stress to them. The majority of the interviewees were female and in their 3rd year in the university.

Table 2 shows that the L1 of 9 out the 10 students is not Mandarin (or Mandarin Chinese) but their dialect. This somehow adds pressure on the students who have to organize their ideas in their L1 and then, if necessary, translate them first to Mandarin before writing in English.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

The analysis of the 30 paragraphs revealed errors that included wrong tenses, wrong word choice and form, no agreement between subject and verb, absence or wrong use of articles and determiners, misspellings, fragmented structures and run-on and/or comma spliced sentences, among others.

Grammatical and Lexical Errors

The analysis revealed that most often there were multiple errors in a sentence. For instance, errors in tense, word form, and spelling may all appear in a sentence, like in the following examples:

If I haven’t study in Malaysia, may I will never know and respeat it.

Errors: tense; spelling

I need to make more different countries people

Errors: word choice; word form; number
my writing skills is still depends on the teacher taught me in high school

Errors: subject-verb agreement; verb tense; word choice and form

language logical are quite difference with my mother tongue; vocabulary using different

Errors: word choice and form; missing words; subject-verb agreement

Table 3 shows some of the errors found in the compositions of the 30 ELC students. The errors include wrong use of verb tense and form of verb, wrong word choice and word form, no agreement between subject and verb, wrong use or absence of articles/determiners, and misspelling.

Tense. The most common error is in tense and this reflects the most significant difference between the Chinese and English language systems. The system of English

Table 3
Some Examples of Grammatical and Lexical Errors according to Types

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grammatical and Lexical Errors</th>
<th>Some examples from the students’ paragraphs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tense (including double verbs, omission of the verb ‘be’, voice)</td>
<td>it was really taught me a lot I must to meet my head of department I’m really feel our teachers’ kindly heart all of the people willing to contribute money my words were confuse listeners there wasn’t allow the dogs swimming in the beach I can feel guilty my writing skills is still depends</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choice of Words (including missing words and word forms)</td>
<td>[She] is very kindly I need to make more different countries people they also dedication towards their work my lonely life oversea your speaking is giving to better but can learning more knowledge I entered my course I am interesting in it it is not means that my English has improvement money let me very touched</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agreement between subject and Verb</td>
<td>That’s are all experiences One of the most precious thing is It make me feel good my writing skills is still depends on the teacher taught me in high school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number: Plural/ Singular Forms of Nouns/Pronouns</td>
<td>one of my dog Interesting lecturer, not much students for a Chinese students who doesn’t read or write English for Chinese student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Absence/Use of Articles and Determiners</td>
<td>I have studied in here make a exhibition area A Malaysia people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spelling and Capitalization</td>
<td>relationships; indepence; english; eign country; studied; beginig</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
verb tenses seems to be one of the biggest problems for Chinese students. This is probably due to the fact that there are no verb tenses in the Chinese language. In the Chinese language system, time adverbs inserted in phrases are used to represent the action. So, irrespective of whether the action takes place in the past, present or future time, the Chinese base form of the verb is the same. Thus, one can argue that the students’ L1 habit in tense choice and use interferes with their choice and use of tense when they write in L2. Brown (2006) claimed that the difficulties for students with L1 to learn L2 depend to a large extent on the differences between L1 and L2. As stated earlier, the more differences there are between the two languages, the more the L1 would interfere in the L2 learning. Thus, the errors in tense that the students committed can be the result of the differences in structures and forms between their L1 (Chinese) and L2 (English).

**Word Choice and Word Form.** Another typical error is wrong word choice and wrong use of word form (parts of speech). Students are possibly not aware that the English word and its Chinese equivalent may not share the same semantic denotation. Also, in the Chinese language, parts of speech are not marked explicitly (Timina, 2013; Zou, 2013). One word can be used as different parts of speech in different contexts. There is no morphological marker to differentiate between nouns and verbs, nouns and adjectives, or adjectives and adverbs. Errors in word form intertwine with errors in choice of word (and spelling). Due to limited vocabulary, the choice of appropriate word (and its form and spelling) becomes a big challenge to them.

**Number.** Another common error is the number of the noun or verb. In English language system, *number* relates to the notion of singularity and plurality of nouns or verbs. The students’ sentences reveal errors of the use (or not use) of plural nouns, despite the presence of modifiers that require them. In the Chinese language system, nouns are not pluralized, and morphemes –s or -es are not added after nouns; instead, the use of numerals is the way to denote plural number. The Chinese language does not use inflections to mark the number and person of a noun or verb. It does not use inflectional morphemes to mark the plurality of a noun or the singularity of a verb. Thus, most students do not add the morpheme (–s) in the plural forms of nouns and in the singular forms of verbs in the 3rd person singular simple present tense. Darus and Ching (2009) who analysed the common errors made by Chinese students in the English essay identified errors in tenses and errors in word forms as the two of the four most common errors found in the essays they analyzed.

**Subject-Verb Agreement.** Closely linked to the error in number is the error in the agreement between subject and verb. In English, the subject and verb must agree in number. That is, if the subject of the sentence is singular then the verb must take the singular form, with –s or –es, and if the subject is plural then the verb form must not have an –s or –es. However, in the
Chinese language, there are no inflectional morphemes such as -s or -es to indicate the singularity of a verb or the plurality of a subject, so there are no singular or plural subjects (or nouns) in the Chinese language. In this instance, the L1 interference may be the reason for the errors found in the students’ sentences.

**Articles/ Determiners.** In English grammar, articles (indefinite article ‘a’ and ‘an’; indefinite article ‘the’) and determiners (possessive pronouns; demonstratives) are obligatory elements in a noun phrase. The analysis showed that the students have a problem in identifying and deciding what and when to use articles and/or determiners. This is probably because in the Chinese language bank, there are some article characters like 一只, 一个, which have the same functions as articles in the English language (Zou, 2013). The Chinese articles can be used in front of any singular nouns, which is quite different from the English articles (‘a’, ‘an’ and ‘the’) whose usage depends on the number of the noun and on whether the noun’s first sound is a consonant or a vowel.

**Syntactic and Structural Errors**

Furthermore, not only grammatical and lexical mistakes but also syntactic and structural errors were found in the paragraphs. There were fragmented structures, comma splices, and run-on sentences. Below are some examples.

When writing, the worst mistake students could commit is to produce fragmented and comma spliced or run-on sentences. Table 4 shows that the fragments are prepositional phrases, dependent or subordinate clauses or v-ing phrases. In English, a subject-verb pair is a must in all sentences, whereas the Chinese writing system does not require a subject-verb combination in every Chinese sentence (Timina, 2013). In a number of instances, students treat the fragments as independent clauses and put a period after them. In addition, some students use a comma to splice two independent clauses instead of using conjunctions, while others string together a series of independent clauses using conjunctions resulting in run-on or “kilometre-long” sentences.

The analysis further revealed that L1 interference errors were caused by the differences in the linguistic and organizational structures between the two languages. Lo and Hyland’s study (2007), reveals that numerous expressions in students’ essays are direct and inappropriate translations from Chinese to English. Likewise, a study of EFL Chinese students composing in L2 conducted by Wang and Wen (2002) revealed that L1 influences were very crucial in L2 writing: when the students had both their L1 and L2 at their disposal when composing they relied more on L1 “when undertaking task-examining and text-generating activities” (p, 231). The errors are like indicators or signals; they show which aspects in L2 the students may struggle with in their writing and therefore, writing teachers have to pay more attention to these aspects.
Students’ Views and Suggestions

When asked whether they found writing in English difficult, all the ten students replied “yes”. As to the reasons why it is difficult, some of their answers are:

When I was writing in English, I had to organize the structure in Chinese, and then translate it to English, it’s complex for me.

Because, for Chinese student[s], we often mix Chinese grammar with English grammar together. But, the rule of English is different with Chinese, it will result in grammatical mistake[s].

[Because of] lack of vocabulary, when expressing the meaning [I] always use the same expression. The Chinese thinking affect[s] my expression in English.

[When] writing in English [we] need to consider grammar, vocabulary, and other aspects; that is a complex process.

[When] writing in English [we] must consider the tense, like future tense, past tense. Besides, I have to get the initial Chinese sentence in mind then translate [it] into English then write [it] down. In addition, [I have to] pay attention to word spelling.

Table 4
Some Examples of Syntactic and Structural Errors according to Types

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of Error</th>
<th>Some examples extracted from the students’ paragraphs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fragments</td>
<td>In every grateful them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>When I first time went to eign country.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Doing more assignments, listening lecturier, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No matter speaking or writing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Because we are limited by our vocabulary and speaking skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>because the metaphor will cause reader be confused.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>First, which is group(s) work sometimes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>So sad and disappointed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comma Splice and/or Run-On Sentences</td>
<td>I remember clearly that we introduce the object is Nick Vujicic, and the topic is “life without limb”, we hand made the publicity board, and we have collected a serious of his information and picture on the internet hand made brochure, we also applied for a donation, we get all of the money will be sent to an organization that can help the disabled people, and all donations will get a free chocolate cake which we handmade, and finally we get 322 RM of money. I think it’s a meaningful event, although the money was not much, but all of the people willing to contribute money let me very touched.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>It’s not only enough that you just know how to speak English, but also you must know how to talk to others with skills, this means that you need to know how to get along with different people and deal with contradictions with them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>We study in different majors, we get busy for doing our assignments, we get busy for our university life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>But, one day, when I bring my article to meet my supervisor, she said she can’t understand what I am talking about, and what is my point and meaning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>At the beginning, I used to think and speak in my L1, then my words were confuse listeners, I was experienced hard time to communicate with others.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Indeed, the Chinese students used “the mode of thinking and reasoning process” based on their L1 habits and thus produce Chinese-style sentences that were understandable to them but not to their writing teachers.

The interview also revealed that students were aware of the interference of their first language (L1) on their writing in English, and of their tendency to translate from their first language to English when writing in English. Faced with the daunting job of writing in a foreign language whose linguistic and syntactic structures differ from their first language, they resort to depending on the structures available in their L1 and “transfer” them to the L2.

When asked whether they think that their mother tongue interferes in their writing in English, all the ten students answered “yes”. When students were asked to comment on what aspect of the English language they found difficult, all except one identified grammar as the most difficult aspect of the English language that would affect their writing, as shown in Table 5.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grammar</th>
<th>Vocabulary</th>
<th>Mechanics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Easy</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Both</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When asked how their writing teachers could help them improve their writing in English, they gave a number of suggestions, which could be categorized into four ‘requests’:

1. Increase their vocabulary by assigning them to read excellent articles /journals /reading materials with follow up activities on vocabulary building.
2. Improve their grammar through tasks, exercises and extra classes focusing on the differences between their L1 and L2 structures.
3. Improve their writing by teaching them how to write “in a professional way”, by giving them excellent examples which they can imitate, by teaching them useful writing skills, by giving extra lectures to students who want to improve their writing (one-on-one tutorials).
4. Point out their mistakes and provide valuable suggestions on how to correct these mistakes.

Interestingly, one student’s request is patience and understanding from the teachers:

“[Teachers] should respect students’ writing. Don’t tease or laugh at students’ mistakes [even if] these mistakes look very foolish in the opinion of [the teachers]. Most of [the] Chinese students from China fear English writing, and they are afraid of making mistakes and being criticized by lecturers. Lecturers should be patient and encourage them to practice more.”
CONCLUSION AND IMPLICATIONS

The analysis revealed that the most common errors were in word choice and form, spelling, tenses, use of articles and determiners, number and agreement of subject and verb. These errors are due in part to students’ unfamiliarity with the various grammatical rules and syntactic structures of the English language, which differ from their L1. During the interview, they stressed that being taught the correct grammar rules in English is an important step towards improving their writing in English. The implication is that writing teachers should also correct grammar errors in their students’ writing (e.g. identifying and correcting subject-verb errors in the paragraphs).

Another possible reason for these errors is the interference of linguistic habits from their L1 (either Mandarin Chinese or their regional dialect). To address this L1 interference, teachers should try to engage students in classroom activities that integrate writing with other language skills (e.g. storytelling using various tenses, debating or dialoguing with emphasis on subject-verb agreement, describing using prepositions and determiners, etc.). More importantly, teachers must put their heart into it: assume multiple roles for these students as teacher, tutor, editor and adviser with no expectations of pay increase or praise from colleagues.

Writing teachers should also urge and cultivate in the students an awareness of English culture, explain the differences between English and Chinese thinking patterns and organizing process habits, and stress avoiding the interference of L1 in their L2 writing by thinking in English. Ye (2013) stressed:

*It is important to help our Chinese students to develop a sense of the nature of writing assignment, raising their awareness of English language and culture, to overcome the negative influence or negative transfer of Chinese language and culture in their writing in English.*

(p. 37)

Grammatical and lexical structures when writing in English are greatly influenced by their L1, so it is imperative that English writing teachers be aware of the difficulties students face in the process of writing in order to help them overcome these difficulties and make progress in their learning of the English language.

It is hoped that this qualitative case study would help fellow writing teachers in English in some small way to be aware of the most frequently occurring errors in our Chinese students’ writings and the reasons why those errors are committed, and to help them decide on what appropriate teaching strategies to adopt to assist Chinese students to improve their writing in our classes.

The major limitation of the study is its small sample size. Future studies may include all the Chinese students across the seven faculties of the university. With a larger sample, a clearer and more reliable conclusion on language errors and L1 interference among Chinese students from mainland China can be drawn.
REFERENCES


Zou, R. (2013). *The common English errors committed by Chinese national students in ELC, UCSI.* Unpublished project paper for Bachelor of Arts in English Language and Communication, UCSI University, KL, Malaysia.